

Presidentially Appointed Positions Dataset-2020

This dataset includes all civilian presidential appointments requiring Senate confirmation as of January 20, 2021. This includes positions in the Executive, Legislative, and Judicial branches and positions outside the U.S. government in Washington, DC government and international organizations. It excludes military, Public Health Service, Foreign Service, and judicial nominations.

CONSTRUCTION OF THE DATASET

The basic data were downloaded from the 2020 U.S. Government publication *Policy and Supporting Positions* (i.e., the Plum Book). The U.S. Congress produces this publication every 4 years to coincide with presidential elections. The House of Representatives and the Senate take turns publishing the document. The Government Printing Office maintains a website that allows downloading the data in Microsoft Excel Format.¹ Once downloaded, I sorted the data by type of appointment and kept only the positions listing PAS (i.e., presidential appointment, Senate confirmation) as the type of appointment.

I supplemented and checked the 2020 Plum Book data with data from three sources. The most important of these sources is Davis and Greene 2017, a Congressional Research Service (CRS) publication that lists all Senate-confirmed positions by the Senate committee responsible for confirmation. I also consulted the Partnership for Public Service's Political Appointee Tracker, a web-based database that tracks key appointed positions and the time it takes presidents to identify nominees and get them confirmed.² Finally, I examined all nominations in 2021 on congress.gov, which includes details on all presidential nominations to Senate confirmed positions.

I proceeded in four steps after preparing the Plum Book data. First, I went through each position in Davis and Greene 2017 and added all Senate confirmed positions that were not included in the Plum Book.³ Second, I compared the list of positions in the Plum Book and Davis and Greene 2017 and manually checked every position where there was a discrepancy. Third, I compared the positions

¹ Persons can download the data a zip file from the following website: <https://www.govinfo.gov/app/details/GPO-PLUMBOOK-2020/>, accessed August 18, 2021.

² Davis, Christopher M., and Michael Greene. 2017. *Presidential Appointee Positions Requiring Senate Confirmation and Committees Handling Nominations*. CRS Report RL30959, May 3, 2017; Partnership for Public Service, Biden Political Appointee Tracker (<https://ourpublicservice.org/political-appointee-tracker/>, accessed August 19, 2021).

³ Davis and Greene 2017 also includes Senate committee information, a full list of positions that no longer require Senate confirmation under the Presidential Appointment Efficiency and Streamlining Act of 2011, and positions receiving privileged treatment in the Senate under S. Res 116. The president signed the Presidential Appointment Efficiency and Streamlining Act of 2011 into law on August 10, 2012. It removed Senate confirmation requirements from about 160 positions. The Senate enacted S. Res 116 on June 29, 2011. It establishes expedited procedures for the consideration of less controversial nominations. The nominations listed in S. Res 116 are not referred to committee. Rather, they are placed directly on the Senate Executive Calendar under the title "Privileged Nominations—Information Requested." The nominations remain in this status until the relevant committee chair notifies the executive clerk that the "appropriate biographical and financial questionnaires have been received." At this point, the nomination is placed in "Privileged Nomination—Information Received" category for 10 days of a Senate session. After this, the nomination is moved to the "Nominations" section of the Senate Executive Calendar. During the period a nomination is in the "Privileged Nomination—Information Requested" or "Privileged Nomination—Information Received" sections of the Senate Executive Calendar, any Senator can direct the nomination be referred to the appropriate committee. This information is from Davis and Greene 2017, 3.

against those included in the Political Appointee Tracker.⁴ Finally, I examined all nominations after January 20, 2021 and added any positions omitted from all three of these sources. I note all differences between the sources in Appendix A at the end of this codebook.

There were 1,331 Senate-confirmed positions. Of these positions, 265 (19.13%) were omitted from the Plum Book.

Plum Book Omissions and Errors

The Plum Book both omitted some positions that should be included and included some positions that should be excluded.⁵ Here is a list of the kinds of changes made to the original Plum Book data:

- Positions listed in the CRS report that were omitted from the Plum Book.
- Positions omitted from both the Plum Book and the CRS report, perhaps because they were created after the publication of each. These include positions listed on the Political Appointee Tracker or the Senate nominations website (https://www.senate.gov/legislative/nominations_new.htm).
- Positions listed in the Plum Book that have been eliminated. The data reported in the Plum Book is collated during the summer of the election year. Positions eliminated during 2020 are sometimes erroneously included. Agencies providing data for the Plum Book also make errors themselves and do not realize positions exist that positions have been eliminated. Some agencies are missed altogether.
- Positions listed as PAS in the Plum Book but do not require Senate confirmation, either because that requirement has been eliminated or the Plum Book listed the wrong appointment authority.
- Cases where the Plum lists a commission position and a chair position as separate positions, making it appear that there are more appointees than there are. On many commissions, the chair must be nominated by the president and confirmed by the Senate but the person must also be one of the commissioners.⁶ There are two nominations and confirmations but one position on the board or commission.
- Duplicates: there are a few cases where the Plum Book includes a position twice.
- Presidential flexibility: there are a few types of positions, including positions with the rank of ambassador, where presidents can unilaterally create a position that requires nomination by the president and confirmation by the Senate.⁷

⁴ I did this in the context of creating indicators for whether a position is a key position and whether the position was occupied by a holdover.

⁵ In Appendix A I also list positions included in the Plum Book but omitted in the CRS report or other omissions or errors in the CRS report. Since CRS published this report in 2017, there were several cases where positions were created, eliminated, renamed, or reorganized after the publication of that report. There were also a few errors in the report itself.

⁶ For details on different chair selection and removal rules see Selin and Lewis 2018.

⁷ Notably, 22 U.S.C. SEC. 3942 reads: “APPOINTMENTS BY THE PRESIDENT.—(a)(1) The President may, by and with the advice and consent of the Senate, appoint an individual as a chief of mission, as an ambassador at large, as an ambassador, as a minister, as a career member of the Senior Foreign Service, or as a Foreign Service officer. (2)(A) The President may, by and with the advice and consent of the Senate, confer the personal rank of career ambassador upon a career member of the Senior Foreign Service in recognition of especially distinguished service over a sustained period. (B)(i) Subject to the requirement of clause (ii), the President may confer the personal rank of ambassador or minister on an individual in connection with a special mission for the President of a temporary nature not exceeding six months in duration. (ii) The President may confer such personal rank only if, prior to such conferral, he transmits to the Committee on Foreign Relations of the Senate a written report setting forth— (I) the necessity for conferring such rank, (II) the dates

- Dual-hatted positions: There are a number of Senate confirmed positions that are filled by other PAS appointees. For example, when Steven T. Mnuchin was nominated to become the Secretary of the Treasury in 2017, he also assumed positions on the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development and the International Monetary Fund. Rather than double-count these positions, I remove them from the dataset.
- The Plum Book includes some positions, like those on the Joint Chiefs that are military, rather than civilian positions. The Plum Book also lists the court of appeals for the armed forces, and military commission appellate judges. I do not include these positions in the dataset.
- Incorrect details: There are cases where the details about the position, whether the incumbent name, position location, or the presence of a fixed term are in error.
- The CRS report does not include a list of ambassadors. I compared the 2020 list to the 2016 list. There are some discrepancies. These include name changes and cases where the president created new ambassadorial positions.

Special Case of the State Department and Ambassadors and Other Dual Hatted Appointees

There are a number of ambassadorial positions where an ambassador confirmed to one position generally becomes ambassador to another country at the same time. For example, a recent nomination for Ambassador to Barbados reads:

Leandro Rizzuto, of New Jersey, to be Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the United States of America to Barbados, and to serve concurrently and without additional compensation as Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the United States of America to the Federation of Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Antigua and Barbuda, the Commonwealth of Dominica, Grenada, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines.

Among the ambassadorships that fall in this category are the following:

1. AMB to Barbados (concurrently accredited to Dominica, Grenada, Antigua, St Kitts, St Nevis)
2. AMB for Senegal (Guinea-Bissau after 1998)
3. AMB for Sri Lanka (Maldives)
4. AMB for Mauritius (Seychelles after 1996)
5. AMB for Italy (San Marino)
6. AMB for Spain (Andorra)
7. AMB for Fiji (Tuvalu, Tonga, Kiribati)
8. AMB for Madagascar (Comoros)
9. AMB for Switzerland (Liechtenstein)
10. AMB for Gabon (Sao Tome)
11. AMB for Papua New Guinea (Solomon Islands and Vanuatu)
12. AMB for New Zealand (Samoa)
13. AMB for France (Monaco)

during which such rank will be held, (III) the justification for not submitting the proposed conferral of personal rank to the Senate as a nomination for advice and consent to appointment, and (IV) all relevant information concerning any potential conflict of interest which the proposed recipient of such personal rank may have with regard to the special mission. Such report shall be transmitted not less than 30 days prior to conferral of the personal rank of ambassador or minister except in cases where the President certifies in his report that urgent circumstances require the immediate conferral of such rank. (C) An individual upon whom a personal rank is conferred under subparagraph (A) or (B) shall not receive any additional compensation solely by virtue of such personal rank. (3) Except as provided in paragraph (2)(B) of this subsection or in clause 3, section 2, article II of the Constitution (relating to recess appointments), an individual may not be designated as ambassador or minister, or be designated to serve in any position with the title of ambassador or minister, without the advice and consent of the Senate.”

I did not remove the ambassadorial positions above from the dataset since, in principle, the president could nominate persons for these other positions (e.g., Ambassador to Monaco). Yet, users of the data may want to exclude these cases.

Special Case of Chief Financial Officers

The Chief Financial Officers Act of 1990 details CFOs in 25 different departments or agencies. Of these 25 positions, 17 may be filled through presidential nomination and Senate confirmation. The law allows, however, that the president may designate other Senate-confirmed appointees to fill this role -- in addition to the position to which they were already confirmed. For example, an Assistant Secretary for Management might also serve as CFO.

In this data, I do not include all 17 possible Senate-confirmed CFO positions as distinct positions since this make determining their vacancy status and the date of nomination difficult. Rather, I use the Plum Book as the guide. If the CFO position is listed separately as a PAS position within the agency, I treat it as such in this data.

Special Case of the Development Banks

According to Davis and Mansfield 2012, the Presidential Appointment Efficiency and Streamlining Act of 2011 made the following changes: “Additionally, for the positions of Governor and Alternate Governor for the African Development Bank, Asian Development Bank, and African Development Fund, the President can nominate an individual with the advice and consent of the Senate, or he can designate an individual to fill those positions from among individuals serving in positions that are already, independently, subject to advice and consent of the Senate.” In this data, these positions are still included as separate positions but they can be filled by others with Senate confirmation.

Special Case of the Federal Regional Commissions and Authorities

There are seven regional commissions created in statute: Appalachian Regional Commission, Delta Regional Authority, Denali Commission, Northern Border Regional Commission, Northern Great Plains Regional Authority, Southeast Crescent Regional Commission, and the Southwest Border Regional Commission. These are quasi-governmental partnerships intended to enhance economic development in the various regions. All seven include a federal co-chair nominated by the president and confirmed by the Senate. The commissions also include governors from the member states, one of whom is appointed a co-chair. The CRS notes, “Of the seven federal regional commissions and authorities, four could be considered active: Appalachian Regional Commission, Delta Regional Authority, Denali Commission, and Northern Border Regional Commission.”⁸ The report notes, however, that the president nominated and the Senate confirmed the first federal co-chair to the Southeast Crescent Regional Commission in 2021. In this data (2020), I include all of these regional commissions even though several are inactive.

Nominations Data Additions

⁸ Congressional Research Service. 2021. *Federal Regional Commissions and Authorities: Structural Features and Function*. CRS Report R45997, December 22, 2021 (<https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/R/R45997>, accessed February 4, 2022).

To connect nominations data to positions, I used data from congress.gov. I downloaded all formal nominations to civilian positions during the first year of the 117th Congress (from January 20, 2021 to January 20, 2022)⁹, excluding judgeships, and matched nominations to vacant positions. The page looked like the following:

The screenshot shows the CONGRESS.GOV website with search results for nominations. The page is titled "Nominations" and shows a search bar with "Examples: PN217, John Smith" and a search button. Below the search bar, there are filters for "Refined by" (Nominations, 117 (2021-2022), Civilian) and "Hide Filters". The results are displayed in a table with columns for "NOMINATION", "Congress", "Nominee", "Organization", "Description", "Date Received from President", "Committee", and "Latest Action". The first nomination is for Dara Lindenbaum, the second for Mary Green Swig, and the third for Nathalie Rayes. The page also includes a sidebar with "Limit Your Search" options and a "More Options" dropdown.

From this page I extracted information on nomination number, unique web page url for each nomination, Congress, name of nominee, organization, description of nomination (e.g., “Jane Smith to be Assistant Secretary of Defense, vice Joe Smith, resigned”), date received from President, committee, latest action date, latest action (e.g., confirmed by the Senate by voice vote, Returned to the President under the provisions of Senate Rule XXXI, paragraph 6 of the Standing Rules of the Senate).

Multiple Nominations to the Same Position

For each position I include only the first nomination to a position. So, for example, if a nominee was withdrawn or rejected and another nomination occurred within the first year, I only include the first nomination.

Dealing with Nominations to be Chair on a Board or Commission

For some commissions, presidents must nominate and the Senate must confirm a chair from among the members of the commission. Other commissions select their chairs in different ways.¹⁰ This can create difficulty in connecting nominees to positions. The president may nominate a sitting member of commission to be chair in place of a chair whose term has expired. The nomination can be to 1) raise a sitting commissioner to the position as chair, 2) name the person to the slot on the commission held by the chair (i.e., their fixed term appointment as a commissioner but not chair), or 3) both with a nomination. This makes assessing the filling of vacancies difficult. If a sitting member is nominated to fill a position held by the chair, it is difficult to determine whether a nomination has been made to

⁹ The key date for determining inclusion in the first year of nominations is the date the Senate received the formal nomination from the president.

¹⁰ For details see Selin and Lewis 2018.

fill a vacancy on the commission since the number of vacant commission slots has not changed. This dataset focuses on vacancies in board or commission positions, not chairs (unless a nominee to fill a chair role also fills the vacant board or commission role).

VARIABLES

IDPos: This includes unique position identifiers.

Dep: This is a short acronym indicating the agency name at the highest level of aggregation. So, for sub-components of larger departments, this includes the department identifier (e.g., DOJ is entered for the Federal Bureau of Investigation).

Agcynname: This is the name for the agency name at the highest level of aggregation. So, for sub-components of larger departments, this includes the name of the department (e.g., DOJ is entered for the Federal Bureau of Investigation).

Orgname: This is the name of the sub-component of an agency if there is one. Within DOJ, for example, this would be Federal Bureau of Investigation for the Director the Federal Bureau of Investigation. For an agency without any sub-components, this is just the agency name (e.g., Administrative Conference of the United States is listed under both agcynname and orgname).

Location: The office location of the position.

Title: Title of the Senate confirmed position.

Nameofincumbent: The name of the person filling the job at the time the Plum Book was put together in the fall of 2020. If a position was vacant, this cell includes the word vacant. For positions added from Davis and Greene, this cell is often empty.

It should be noted, however, that the presence of an incumbent does not imply that the position is not vacant. Most executive appointees will leave prior to Inauguration Day on January 20, 2021. Others, particularly board or commission members, will stay until a replacement is confirmed. The statutes regarding whether/how long board members can stay in their positions after their terms have expired varies by agency (Selin and Lewis 2018).

Vacant (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is available for presidential appointment and 0 otherwise. Either the position is listed as vacant in the Plum Book or an incumbent is listed but they can be replaced after a successful nomination and confirmation. This variable *does not* account for holdovers, persons asked to stay on or allowed to stay on by the new administration.

For commissions, the statutes governing many of these agencies allow members to continue serving even after their terms have expired, often until a replacement has been confirmed. Persons serving after expired terms are coded with a 1 since these positions are available for appointment. In the dataset, the variable **Nameofincumbent** includes the word “vacant” in cases where a position has no Senate confirmed person serving in that role. In cases where a Senate confirmed appointee serves after their term has expired, their name is listed. In these cases, where the position has a fixed term, the variable **Expires** is often blank where it includes a value for other commission members.

U.S. attorneys and U.S. marshals are appointed for 4-year terms but the law provides that they “are subject to the removal by the President.” (28 U.S. Code sec. 541; 28 U.S. Code sec. 561) They are not considered to have fixed terms in this data since they serve at the pleasure of the president. Similarly, ambassadors serve at the pleasure of the president even though their terms are often informally 3 years.

Payplan: This variable includes letter codes that denote the pay system for the position listed. These include:

AD = Administratively Determined Rates
EX = Executive Schedule
FA = Foreign Service Chiefs of Mission
GS = General Schedule
OT = Other Pay Plan* (all those not listed separately)
PD = Daily Pay Rate* (per diem)
SL = Senior Level
WC = Without Compensation*

There are a number of agencies for which no pay plan is listed. Some are difficult to classify. For example, they might pay some nominal amount that is neither a real salary nor a per diem. Others are compensated according to the scheme of the larger organization if it is an organization that is a government corporation (e.g., Federal Agricultural Mortgage Corporation) or multilateral organization (e.g., European Bank for Reconstruction and Development).

Pay: This column includes a specified level or pay under each pay plan if one exists. If this cell is blank, the position does not have an established or fixed pay rate, rather it varies even for persons holding the same position.

Tenure: This is the terms or durations of positions in years. If there are no values in this column, there are no fixed terms. Values that occur in the data (with number of cases in parentheses) include:

1 Year (13)
2 Years (6)
3 Years (65)
4 Years (41)
5 Years (114)
6 Years (131)
7 Years (13)
9 Years (19)
10 Years (3)
14 Years (7)
15 Years (1)

United States Attorneys are considered removable even though they are considered having 4-year terms. Similarly, the FBI director is appointed for a 10-year term but he is listed as removable in the dataset. The Plum Book does not list a fixed term for either position.

Expires: This is the expiration date for time-limited appointments. If this cell is blank, either there is no fixed term or the person serves in a position under an expired term.

MgtAgency (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the agency is designed to focus on government-wide management issues. Agencies coded with a 1 include:

- Administrative Conference of the United States
- Architect of the Capitol
- Federal Labor Relations Authority
- Federal Mediation and Conciliation Service
- General Services Administration
- Government Accountability Office
- Library of Congress
- Merit Systems Protection Board
- Office of Government Ethics
- Office of Management and Budget
- Office of Personnel Management
- Office of Special Counsel

Among the agencies on this list the General Services Administration, Office of Management and Budget, Office of Personnel Management are the key executive branch agencies responsible for government-wide management.

POSITION CHARACTERISTICS

This coding is based upon the title of *positions* rather than the agency or responsibilities of positions not reflected in titles. For example, some agencies deal specifically with management (e.g., Office of Personnel Management). This coding is specific to *positions* within agencies rather than across agencies. So, for example, while the Office of Management and Budget deals with various aspects of agency management, only positions specifically related to management inside the agency are coded with a 1 (e.g., the Deputy Director for Management). Other positions within the agency are not.

Management (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 for positions specifically designated for management in their title and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as Assistant/Under Secretary for Management, Chief Executive Officer, and Chief Management Officer.

This variable does not include deputy positions (e.g., deputy secretary) or positions specifically related to personnel, finances or acquisition (e.g. Chief Financial Officer, Assistant Secretary for Acquisition). These latter positions are coded separately and can be combined to create a larger variable for positions specifically related to management. Some positions can be coded 1 for both management and another category (e.g., finance, human capital) such as Chief Financial Officer and Assistant Secretary for Administration.

Deputy (0,1): In many large agencies the deputy serves as the inward focused political leadership. Deputy Secretaries, for example, are widely understood to take on departmental management responsibilities so that the Secretary can be outward focused. This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is the primary deputy to a more prominent official and 0 otherwise. Some agencies have several deputies and among these only generic positions or deputy positions focused toward management specifically are coded with a 1. For example the Deputy Administrator of FEMA is coded

with a 1 but the Deputy Administrator of FEMA for Protection and National Preparedness is not. Under secretaries in the Military Services are coded with a 1.

HumanCapital (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with personnel or human capital and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

Finance (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with agency finances, budgets, or spending and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

- Assistant Secretary—Policy Management and Budget
- Chief Financial Officer
- Comptroller
- Controller
- Deputy Secretary of State for Management and Resources

The Chief Financial Officers Act of 1990 details CFOs in 25 different departments or agencies. Of these 25 positions, 17 may be filled through presidential nomination and Senate confirmation. The law allows, however, that the president may designate other Senate-confirmed appointees to fill this role -- in addition to the position to which they were already confirmed. For example, an Assistant Secretary for Management might also serve as CFO.

These data do not include all 17 possible Senate-confirmed CFO positions as distinct positions since this makes determining their vacancy status and the date of nomination difficult. Rather, using the Plum Book as the guide, if the CFO job is listed separately as a PAS position within the agency, it is treated as such in this data. This implies that the data may not properly identify all CFO positions in government.

Acquisition (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position – not agency -- deals with agency procurement and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

- Administrator Office of Federal Procurement Policy
- Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Acquisition, Technology, Logistics)
- Assistant Secretary of the Army (Acquisition, Logistics and Technology)
- Assistant Secretary of the Navy (Research Development and Acquisition)
- Assistant Secretary of Defense (Acquisition)
- Principal Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Acquisition, Technology and Logistics)
- Under Secretary of Defense (Acquisition, Technology, and Logistics)

Congress (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with legislative affairs and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

- Assistant Administrator for Legislative and Public Affairs
- Assistant Secretary for Congressional Relations
- Assistant Secretary for Legislative and Intergovernmental Affairs

PublicAffairs (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with public affairs or communications and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

Assistant Secretary for Communications and Information
Assistant Secretary, Office of Communications and Outreach
Assistant Administrator for Legislative and Public Affairs

Policy (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with policy and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

Assistant Secretary for Planning, Evaluation, and Policy Development
Assistant Secretary for Policy Development and Research
Assistant Secretary - Policy Management and Budget
Principal Deputy Under Secretary of Defense for Policy

This variable only codes with a 1 positions that cover department-wide policy. So, it includes and Assistant Secretary for Transportation Policy but not an Assistant Secretary for Tax Policy or Disability Employment Policy. This is obviously relative to the unit of analysis but few sub-components have specific appointed positions for policy.

CEO (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position title includes a CEO title and 0 otherwise. Some examples include Chief Executive Officer of the Corporation for National and Community Service and the Chairman and CEO of the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board.

Programeval (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position title includes the word evaluation related to programs and 0 otherwise. Some examples include the Assistant Secretary of Health and Human Services for Planning and Evaluation.

Planning (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position title includes the word planning and 0 otherwise. Some examples include the Assistant Secretary of Health and Human Services for Planning and Evaluation, the Director of the Policy Planning Staff in the State Department, and the Assistant Secretary for Policy and Planning in the Department of Veterans Affairs.

Information (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position title indicates that the position involves information technology and 0 otherwise. Some examples include the Assistant Secretary for Information and Technology in the Department of Veterans Affairs.

CivilRights (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals with civil rights and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

Assistant Secretary for Civil Rights
Assistant Secretary for Civil Rights
Director of the Office of Minority Economic Impact

Gcounsel (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a general counsel position and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

Chief Counsel
General Counsel
Legal Adviser to the Department of State
Solicitor of Labor

Solicitor

Chair (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is the chair of a board or commission and 0 otherwise.

Notably, there are some persons called chairs but their roles extend beyond being the head of a board or commission. Some chairs are also CEOs. These include such positions in the National Endowment for the Arts and Humanities and Millennium Challenge Corporation.

RD (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position deals research and development and 0 otherwise. Positions with titles such as the following are coded with a 1:

- Assistant Administrator for Research and Development
- Assistant Secretary of Defense for Research and Engineering
- Assistant Secretary of the Navy (Research Development and Acquisition)
- Assistant Secretary for Policy Development and Research
- Assistant Secretary for Research and Technology
- Director, Advanced Research Project Agency – Energy
- Director, Office of Financial Research
- Under Secretary for Research, Education and Economics

NonEB (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the agency is located in the District of Columbia, Judicial Branch, Legislative Branch, a regional or international organization, or an entity whose board is selected by other persons other than the president and 0 otherwise. Some agencies coded with a 1 include:

- Appalachian Regional Commission
- Architect of the Capitol
- Asian Development Bank
- African Development Bank
- Court Services and Offender Supervision Agency for the District of Columbia
- Government Accountability Office
- Government Publishing Office
- International Monetary Fund
- Library of Congress
- United States Sentencing Commission

Commission (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the agency is a multi-member body and 0 otherwise.

IG (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is an inspector general position and 0 otherwise.

Ambassador (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is an ambassadorial position and 0 otherwise.

Concurrent (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is an ambassadorial position but filled in a concurrent capacity and 0 otherwise. There are a number of ambassadorial positions where an

ambassador confirmed to one position generally becomes ambassador to another country at the same time. For example, a recent nomination for Ambassador to Barbados reads:

Leandro Rizzuto, of New Jersey, to be Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the United States of America to Barbados, and to serve concurrently and without additional compensation as Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the United States of America to the Federation of Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Antigua and Barbuda, the Commonwealth of Dominica, Grenada, and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines.

Among the ambassadorships that fall in this category are the following:

1. AMB to Barbados (concurrently accredited to Dominica, Grenada, Antigua, St Kitts, St Nevis)
2. AMB for Senegal (Guinea-Bissau after 1998)
3. AMB for Sri Lanka (Maldives)
4. AMB for Mauritius (Seychelles after 1996)
5. AMB for Italy (San Marino)
6. AMB for Spain (Andorra)
7. AMB for Fiji (Tuvalu, Tonga, Kiribati)
8. AMB for Madagascar (Comoros)
9. AMB for Switzerland (Liechtenstein)
10. AMB for Gabon (Sao Tome)
11. AMB for Papua New Guinea (Solomon Islands and Vanuatu)
12. AMB for New Zealand (Samoa)
13. AMB for France (Monaco)

All the positions listed in parentheses are coded with a 1 and 0 otherwise.

USMarshal (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is United States Marshal position and 0 otherwise. There were two nominations for Marshal positions not included in the 2016 Plum Book:

1. Gary G. Schofield, of Nevada, to be United States Marshal for the District of Nevada for the term of four years, vice Christopher Tobias Hoye, term expired.
2. David A. Weaver, of Colorado, to be United States Marshal for the District of Colorado for the term of four years, vice John Leroy Kammerzell, term expired.

USAttorney (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a United States Attorney position and 0 otherwise.

PartTime (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a part time position and 0 otherwise. The source for this data was Davis and Greene 2017 and pay plans indicating that a person was paid per diem (PD) or served without compensation (WC). Davis and Greene 2017 includes a section for each committee that lists all part-time positions.

Eop (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the agency is a component of the Executive Office of the President and 0 otherwise.

Cabinet (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is part of an executive department 0 otherwise. This assumes 15 executive departments – State, Treasury, Defense, Justice, Interior, Agriculture, Commerce, Labor, Health and Human Services, Housing and Urban Development, Transportation, Energy, Education, Veterans Affairs, Homeland Security.

Indadmin (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a component of an independent administration and 0 otherwise. An independent administration is a federal agency that is part of the executive establishment but neither part of the EOP/Cabinet nor a commission. Some examples include the Environmental Protection Agency and the National Aeronautics and Space Administration. The source for this coding is Selin and Lewis 2018, Table 3 (p. 42).

One difficulty with coding these agencies is that some are run by one person but have a board also. It can be difficult to determine what is a board and what is an administration. Notably, the Broadcasting Board of Governors and the component parts of the National Foundation on the Arts and Humanities are coded as independent administrations, directed by single individuals but with boards attached. So, these agencies are coded as independent administrations but many of the Senate confirmed positions are to commissions that are part of these agencies.

Indcom (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is part of an independent commission and 0 otherwise. Commissions that are not part of an executive department include agencies such as:

- Consumer Product Safety Commission
- Federal Reserve
- Federal Trade Commission
- National Labor Relations Board

Some agencies regularly treated as independent are situated by law within executive departments. Some examples include:

- Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (Energy)
- National Indian Gaming Commission (Interior)
- Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (Labor)
- Surface Transportation Board (Transportation)

These are coded as part of executive departments but they operate as independent of the executive departments.

Other (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a component of an entity that is not wholly part of the executive establishment and 0 if it is. This variable is coded with a 1 if the nominee is appointed to part of the District of Columbia government, Judicial Branch, Legislative Branch, a regional or international organization with shared governance, a non-profit, or an *independent* entity whose board is selected by other persons other than the president and 0 otherwise.¹¹ Some agencies coded with a 1 include:

- Appalachian Regional Commission (others appoint leadership)
- Architect of the Capitol (Legislative)
- Asian Development Bank (others appoint leadership)
- African Development Bank (others appoint leadership)

¹¹ For example, if nominees to these positions are employees of the Department of State (e.g., special representatives to international organizations or ambassadors) they are coded with a 0. Persons named directly from the United States to an institution with shared governance (i.e., other entities also select organization leadership) they are coded with a 1.

Court Services and Offender Supervision Agency for the District of Columbia (DC government)
Government Accountability Office (Legislative)
Government Publishing Office (Legislative)
International Monetary Fund (others appoint leadership)
Library of Congress (Legislative)
United States Sentencing Commission (Judicial)

Legbranch (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a component of an entity in the legislative branch and 0 otherwise. Some examples include the Architect of the Capitol and the Librarian of Congress.

Judbranch (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a component of an entity in the judicial branch and 0 otherwise. The U.S. Sentencing Commission is a good example.

Sharedgov (0,1) This variable is coded with a 1 if the position is a component of an entity whose leadership is selected partly by the president and partly by another entity and 0 otherwise. For example, the President nominates Trustees for the Harry S Truman Scholarship Foundation but not all of them. Other trustees are selected by the President of the Senate and the Speaker of the House. Similarly, a board governs the Metropolitan Washington Airport Authority and the President nominates 3 out of 17 members.

If a board includes members designated by other presidentially appointed or executive branch officials and the president, this is still coded with a 0. This is only coded 1 if board members are selected by other governments, shareholders, or persons on the judicial or legislative branches.

Ideology: This is the ideology of the agency from Richardson, Clinton, and Lewis 2018. Where sub-components were easily matched to ideology scores, those scores were used. Where matching was difficult or uncertain, the department estimate was used. Higher values imply more conservative agencies.

Committee: The name of the Senate Committee that considers nominations for this position. Some positions are referred to more than one committee. The details of such positions are included in Davis and Greene 2017.

Fixedterm: This is my own coding of fixed terms using data first from Davis and Greene and then data from the Plum Book. If there are no values in this column, there are no fixed terms. Values that occur in the data (with number of cases in parentheses) include: 1(13), 2 (4), 3(45), 4(36), 5(104), 6(116), 7(13), 9(19), 10(2), 14(7), 15(1).

United States Attorneys are considered removable even though they are considered having 4-year terms. Similarly, the FBI director is appointed for a 10 year term but he is listed as removable in the dataset. The Plum Book does not list a fixed term for either position.

Secondcommittee: The name of a second Senate Committee that considers nominations for this position. Some positions are referred to more than one committee. Whenever I came across another committee I listed it in the database. I have not yet comprehensively searched to see whether each

position has more than one committee. Davis and Greene 2017 would be the right source for such an effort.

Privileged (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the this position was listed in Senate Resolution 116 of June 29, 2011.¹² This resolution establishes expedited procedures for the consideration of less controversial nominations. The nominations listed in S. Res 116 are not referred to committee. Rather, they are placed directly on the Senate Executive Calendar under the title “Privileged Nominations—Information Requested.” The nominations remain in this status until the relevant committee chair notifies the executive clerk that the “appropriate biographical and financial questionnaires have been received.” At this point, the nomination is placed in “Privileged Nomination—Information Received” category for 10 days of a Senate session. After this, the nomination is moved to the “Nominations” section of the Senate Executive Calendar. During the period a nomination is in the “Privileged Nomination—Information Requested” or “Privileged Nomination—Information Received” sections of the Senate Executive Calendar, any Senator can direct the nomination be referred to the appropriate committee. This information is from Davis and Greene 2017, 3.

Notes: Text detailing issues or concerns about the entry

NotinPlum (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the position was not included in the 2016 Plum Book and added based upon information in Davis and Greene 2017. This variable is also coded with a 1 if the position was included but it was not labeled as requiring Senate confirmation. For example, four commissioners on the Securities and Exchange Commission were listed as having no Senate confirmation requirement.

Deppriority (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the department-level agency unit is responsible for carrying out an item on President Trump’s *Contract with the American Voter* and 0 otherwise.¹³ Issues were pulled from this 2016 campaign document and connected with EOP agencies, executive departments or independent agencies by David Lewis on December 17, 2019.

This coding is at the highest level of aggregation. For example, the Office of Personnel Management is coded with a 1 since it is involved in a hiring freeze. Similarly, the Office of Management and Budget is coded with a 1 because of its role in regulatory reform. The Department of State is coded with a 1 because of its role in pulling out of the Trans-Pacific Partnership (and other issues). A list of issues and their related agencies is included in Appendix A.

Bpriority (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if this subcomponent of a larger agency is specifically responsible for carrying out an item on President Trump’s *Contract with the American Voter*. For example, Immigration and Customs Enforcement, Citizenship and Immigration Services, and Customs and Border Protection are coded with a 1 because of their role in immigration enforcement. A list of issues and their related agencies is included in Appendix A. Positions in agencies with no subcomponents are coded with a 0.

¹² For the full text see: <https://www.congress.gov/bill/112th-congress/senate-resolution/116/text>, accessed January 26, 2020.

¹³ This comes from <https://assets.donaldjtrump.com/landings/contract/O-TRU-102316-Contractv02.pdf>, accessed December 17, 2019.

This variable can be useful in specifications with department-level fixed effects to see if priority areas get filled first.

Extras from the initial Plum Book download

orglevel:
ID Number:

Nominations data

The nominations page from Congress.gov looked like the following and is the source of all variables related to nominations.

The screenshot shows the Congress.gov search results page for nominations. The search criteria are refined to 'Nominations' in the '115 (2017-2018)' Congress. The results are sorted by 'Number - Descending' and show 1 of 12 items. The first four results are:

- 1 ENG210** — 115th Congress (2017-2018) — **Thomas Jayne** — Railroad Retirement Board
Thomas Jayne, of Missouri, to be a Member of the Railroad Retirement Board for a term expiring August 28, 2023, vice Steven Joel Anthony, term expired.
Date Received from President: 12/13/2018
Committee: Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions
Latest Action: 01/02/2019 - Confirmed by the Senate by Voice Vote ([All Actions](#))
- 2 ENG210** — 115th Congress (2017-2018) — **Johnathan Bragg** — Railroad Retirement Board
Johnathan Bragg, of Virginia, to be a Member of the Railroad Retirement Board for a term expiring August 28, 2024. (Reappointment)
Date Received from President: 12/13/2018
Committee: Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions
Latest Action: 01/02/2019 - Confirmed by the Senate by Voice Vote ([All Actions](#))
- 3 ENG210** — 115th Congress (2017-2018) — **Johnathan Bragg** — Railroad Retirement Board
Johnathan Bragg, of Virginia, to be a Member of the Railroad Retirement Board for a term expiring August 28, 2019, vice Walter A. Barrows, term expired.
Date Received from President: 12/13/2018
Committee: Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions
Latest Action: 01/02/2019 - Confirmed by the Senate by Voice Vote ([All Actions](#))
- 4 ENG210** — 115th Congress (2017-2018) — **Don Munce** — Corporation for Public Broadcasting
Don Munce, of Florida, to be a Member of the Board of Directors of the Corporation for Public Broadcasting for a term expiring January 31, 2024, vice Loretta Cheryl Sulliff, term expired.
Date Received from President: 12/11/2018
Committee: Commerce, Science, and Transportation
Latest Action: 01/03/2019 - Returned to the President under the provisions of Senate Rule XXXI, paragraph 6 of the Standing Rules of the Senate ([All Actions](#))

From this page a person can download information on nomination number, unique web page url for each nomination, Congress, name of nominee, organization, description of nomination (e.g., Jane Smith to be Assistant Secretary of Defense, vice Joe Smith, resigned), date received from President, committee, latest action date, latest action (e.g., confirmed by the Senate by voice vote, Returned to the President under the provisions of Senate Rule XXXI, paragraph 6 of the Standing Rules of the Senate).

Nomination: This is a unique nomination identifier on congress.gov.

URL: This is the web address that details the history of this specific nomination. An example of such a page is:

The screenshot shows the CONGRESS.GOV website interface. At the top, there are navigation links for "Advanced Searches" and "Browse". A search bar contains the text "PN2703, John Smith". Below the search bar, the page displays "2 OF 1,158 RESULTS". The main content area is titled "PN2703 — Johnathan Bragg — Railroad Retirement Board" and "115th Congress (2017-2018)". A "NOMINATION" tab is active. The nomination details are as follows:

Description	Latest Action
Johnathan Bragg, of Virginia, to be a Member of the Railroad Retirement Board for a term expiring August 26, 2024. (Reappointment)	01/02/2019 - Confirmed by the Senate by Voice Vote.
Organization	Date Received from President
Railroad Retirement Board	12/13/2018
	Committee
	Senate Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions

Below the nomination details, there is a section titled "Actions: PN2703 — 115th Congress (2017-2018)" with a "Sort by: Newest to Oldest" dropdown. A table lists the following actions:

Date	Senate Actions
01/02/2019	Confirmed by the Senate by Voice Vote.
01/02/2019	Considered by Senate.
01/02/2019	Senate Committee on Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions discharged by Unanimous Consent.
12/13/2018	Received in the Senate and referred to the Committee on Health, Education, Labor, and Pensions.

Congress2: This is the number of the Congress that considered this nomination. In this dataset this column includes only two values, the 115th Congress (2017-2018) or 116th Congress (2019-).

Name: This is the name of the person nominated by the president for the vacant position.

Organization: This is the name of the organization to which the person has been nominated. These include positions in the legislative (e.g., Government Accountability Office), executive (e.g., Department of Agriculture), and judicial branches (e.g., U.S. Sentencing Commission) as well as positions in DC Government (e.g., Court Services and Offender Supervision Agency for the District of Columbia), regional (e.g., Appalachian Regional Commission), multilateral (e.g., Northern Border Regional Commission), and international organizations (e.g., Asian Development Bank).

Description: This is the information about the person, the position to which they have been nominated, whether they are replacing someone, and whether position holds a fixed term and when it expires.

Date Received From President: This is the date the Senate received the formal nomination from the President.

Committee2: This is the Senate committee to which the nomination was referred. For a comprehensive listing of positions by committee see Davis and Greene 2017.

Latest Action Date: The most recent date on which an action on this nomination was taken.

Latest Action: The most recent action taken by the Senate on this nomination. The primary categories include:

1. Confirmed by the Senate by Yea-Nay Vote [tally of vote]. Record Vote Number: [number of vote].
2. Confirmed by the Senate by Yea-Nay Vote [tally of the vote]

3. Returned to the President under the provisions of Senate Rule XXXI, paragraph 6 of the Standing Rules of the Senate.

Nomination (0,1): This variable is coded with a 1 if the President nominated a person to fill this position between January 20, 2021 and January 31, 2022 and 0 otherwise.

Days: This is a count of the number of days between inauguration and the day the Senate received the nomination. Positions receiving no nomination prior to January 31, 2022 are coded with 377.

Inauguration: The date the President assumed office. In this dataset this value does not change: January 20, 2021.

Appointeetracker: This is coded with a 1 if the position is listed on the Political Appointee Tracker produced by the Partnership for Public Service and the Washington Post and 0 otherwise (<https://ourpublicservice.org/political-appointee-tracker/>, accessed February 4, 2022).

Holdover: This is coded with a 1 if the political appointee tracker lists this position as having a holdover and 0 otherwise.

Appendix A. Discrepancies Between 2020 Plum Book and Davis and Greene 2017

Change	Description
Position listed in Plum Book but Position eliminated	Under Secretary for Farm and Foreign Agricultural Services eliminated May 11, 2017 ¹⁴
Position listed in Plum Book but Position eliminated	The position of Chief Management Officer in DOD is included in the Plum Book but was eliminated January 1, 2021 in the NDAA for 2021 ¹⁵ . This position was in Plum Book but did not exist on January 20, 2021
Position listed in CRS report but Position eliminated	The 2017 CRS report lists a Deputy Chief Management Officer but that whole office has been eliminated ¹⁶
Position listed in CRS report but position renamed	The Assistant Secretary of Defense (Indo-Pacific Security Affairs) was previously Asian and Pacific Security Affairs
Position listed in CRS report but position renamed	Assistant Secretary of Defense (Sustainment) used to be Logistics and Material Readiness
Position listed in CRS report but position changed; position added	There is no longer an Assistant Secretary for Research and Engineering in DOD but this is listed in the CRS Report. It looks like this position was changed to an under secretary position and a deputy under secretary was created. Both positions are Senate confirmed.
Positions listed in CRS report but positions changed	There were two director positions listed in the CRS report, one for operational energy plans and programs and one for defense research and engineering. Both were converted to Assistant Secretary positions and one later changed again, to a deputy under secretary (research and engineering).
Position listed in CRS report but position has different name	There is a position in the CRS Report called "Assistant to the Secretary—Nuclear and Chemical and Biological Defense Programs" but I believe, after research, this is the Assistant Secretary—Nuclear and Chemical and Biological Defense Programs.
Listed in Plum Book but is an error	There was a position as "strategic adviser to the Under Secretary of Defense" that is listed as PAS in error.
Positions listed in CRS report missing from Plum Book	There was a position as Assistant Secretary of Defense (Energy, Installations, and Environment) missing. There is one in Navy as well.
Presidential power to create new PAS positions	Military Commission judge positions created on October 28, 2009, pursuant to P.L. 111-84, Title XVIII, §1802; 123 Stat. 2603. The statute indicates that "additional judges" may be appointed by the President, with the advice and consent of the Senate, but does not specify how many appointments may be made. Two such nominations were made in the 112th Congress

¹⁴https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Under_Secretary_of_Agriculture_for_Farm_and_Foreign_Agricultural_Services#:~:text=The%20Under%20Secretary%20of%20Agriculture,announced%20on%20May%202011%2C%202017

¹⁵ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chief_Management_Officer_of_the_Department_of_Defense

¹⁶ <https://federalnewsnetwork.com/defense-main/2021/01/pentagon-moves-quickly-to-redistribute-duties-of-now-abolished-chief-management-officer/>

Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from CRS report	The DOD CIO is included in the Plum Book but not the 2017 CRS report. It appears it was created after the publication of the CRS report.
Positions listed in CRS Report but omitted from dataset because they are military appointments	The CRS report lists offices among the Joint Chiefs but the Plum Book omits them since they are not civilian appointees. They are excluded from the dataset.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits members of the Board of Regents, Uniformed Services University of the Health Sciences
Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from CRS report	CRS Report is missing Assistant Secretary for Administration (HUD)
Position listed in CRS report but position eliminated	Director, Office of Thrift Supervision listed in 2017 CRS report but no longer exists.
Positions listed in CRS Report but is a dual-hatted PAS position	CRS Report lists 10 members of Financial Stability Oversight Council but only 1 is an independent member without another PAS role already.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	Plum Book omits National Association of Registered Agents and Brokers, Board of Directors (13) ¹⁷
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	Plum Book omits National Consumer Cooperative Bank, Board of Directors (3)
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	Plum Book omits National Institute of Building Sciences, Board of Directors (6)
Plum Book includes a duplicate	Plum Book lists Assistant Secretary of Commerce for Communications and Information twice
Position listed in CRS report but position eliminated	The CRS report lists and Assistant Secretary of Technology Policy (Commerce) but the Technology Administration was eliminated at the end of the Bush Administration. I cannot find this office in 2020.
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	Plum Book does not include NHTSA.
The Plum Book includes an extra commission position	The Plum Book includes 6 slots for the Consumer Product Safety Commission, one extra for chair. There are 5 members of the commission. The chair does receive and EX III pay and the other commissioners receive EXIV.
The Plum Book but incorrectly listed as PAS; also a dual-hatted position	The Plum Book listed a separate position for Assistant to the President for Technology Policy as a PAS position, apart from the Director of the OSTP

¹⁷ <https://piaadvocacy.com/2020/02/21/what-ever-happened-to-narab/>

Plum Book includes a duplicate	The Plum Book included two associate directors for technology in the OSTP in the EOP
Positions listed in the Plum Book but omitted from the CRS report	The CRS report inaccurately lists the Surface Transportation Board as having 3 members rather than 5. The agency website suggests the board has 5 members (https://prod.stb.gov/about-stb/board-members/).
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book excludes the Corporation for Public Broadcasting (9)
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the PAS members of the Metropolitan Washington Airport Authority (3)
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the St. Lawrence Seaway Development Corporation Advisory Board members (5)
Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from the CRS report; created after 2017	There is a new position from 2018 that was not included in the CRS Report--Assistant Secretary for Cybersecurity, Energy Security & Emergency Response
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Office of the Federal Coordinator, Alaska Natural Gas Transportation Projects.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Puerto Rico Financial Oversight and Management Board. Counting the number PAS positions is tricky since, according to CRS, "Pursuant to §101(e)(2)(E) of P.L. 114-187, the appointment of six of the seven members of the Puerto Rico Financial Oversight and Management Board "shall be by and with the advice and consent of the Senate, unless the President appoints an individual from a list, as provided in this subsection, in which case no Senate confirmation is required." The lists of potential board members referenced are to be submitted by the Speaker and minority leader of the House of Representatives and the majority and minority leaders of the Senate.
The Plum Book includes position but it is no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the Alternate Federal Co-Chairman of the Appalachian Regional Commission but that position no longer requires Senate confirmation under PL 12-166.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omitted on member of the Chemical Safety and Hazard Investigation Board
Positions listed in CRS report but position no longer PAS	The CRS Report lists an Assistant Administrator for Environmental Information/Chief Information Officer but this position was downgraded around 2018.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Deputy Director of the Office of Environmental Quality in the EOP
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omitted two members of the Board of Directors of the TVA.

Positions listed in CRS report but no longer exists.	The CRS report includes a position Assistant Secretary of Commerce for Market Access and Compliance that appears to have disappeared in a 2013 Commerce reorganization but details are hard to find. ¹⁸
Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from the CRS report; created after 2017	The CRS report omits the Assistant Secretary of the Treasury for investment security because it was created after the 2017 report. ¹⁹
Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from the CRS report; created after 2017	The CRS report omits the Special Inspector General for Pandemic Recovery because it was created after the publication of the CRS report. ²⁰
Plum Book includes a duplicate	The Plum Book data includes two entries for the Director, Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation
Plum Book includes incorrect position details	The Plum Book gets the term lengths wrong for members of the International Trade Commission. The Plum Book lists 7 years but they are 9 years.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	Members of the Federal Hospital Insurance Trust Fund Board of Trustees omitted by Plum Book (2)
Positions listed in CRS Report but are dual-hatted PAS positions (include only one set of these positions in dataset)	The same board of trustees runs the following units: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Federal Hospital Insurance Trust Fund • Federal Old-Age and Survivors Trust Fund and Disability Insurance Trust Fund Board • Federal Supplementary Medical Insurance Trust Fund
The Plum Book includes an extra commission position	The Plum Book lists the chair of the Internal Revenue Service Oversight Board as a separate member and so this case was removed (1)
Position listed in CRS report but omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omitted one member of the Social Security Advisory Board (1)
The Plum Book lists a position but it is omitted from the CRS report	The CRS report lists the Assistant Secretary of State (Diplomatic Security) and Director of the Office of Foreign Missions as the same position, though requiring separate confirmations. The 2020 Plum Book lists them as separate positions and they have different incumbents listed. I keep them as separate positions.
The Plum Book lists a position but it is omitted from the CRS report	The Plum Book includes Assistant Secretaries of State for Energy Resources and Intelligence and Research omitted from the 2017 CRS Report. These are included in the Senate nominations data.
Position listed in Plum Book renamed	The Plum Book includes an Ambassador-at-Large for Global Criminal Justice. This was previously called "War Crimes Issues."

¹⁸ <https://2010-2014.commerce.gov/blog/2013/10/18/international-trade-administration-streamlines-its-business-divisions-help-companies.html>

¹⁹ <https://www.wsj.com/articles/senate-confirms-u-s-treasury-official-in-charge-of-national-security-reviews-11568316395>

²⁰ <https://www.sigpr.gov/about-sigpr/sigpr-overview>

Position listed in the CRS report renamed

The CRS report lists a Coordinator for Reconstruction and Stabilization. This position is included in the Plum Book as Assistant Secretary of State for Conflict and Stabilization Operations.

Position listed in the CRS report omitted from Plum Book

The Plum Book omits a Chief of Protocol. According to the State Department website, "Since 1946, the President has commissioned the head of the Department of State's protocol staff as the "Chief of Protocol for the White House." In 1916, the Department of State appointed the first U.S. official to be concerned on a full-time basis with protocol, which is the diplomatic procedure governed by law or international custom and practice. The Department first established a Division of Protocol on Feb 4, 1928. All incumbents since 1961 have held the rank of Ambassador."²¹

Position listed in the CRS report omitted from Plum Book

The Plum Book lists Representative of the U.S. to the Vienna Office of the United Nations and Representative of the U.S. to the International Atomic Energy Agency, With the Rank of Ambassador. The CRS Report lists these positions as distinct. I separate these positions since each requires a separate confirmation.

Position listed in the CRS report omitted from Plum Book

The CRS report includes a position of Deputy Representative to the International Atomic Energy Agency. This was omitted from the Plum Book.

Positions listed in the Plum Book that are omitted from the CRS report; Presidential power to create new PAS positions

After comparing the listed positions in the Plum Book and the CRS report, the following non-ambassador positions remain in the Plum Book that are not in the CRS report:

- Special Representative and Policy Coordinator for Burma, With the Rank of Ambassador
- Special Envoy on North Korean Human Rights Issues, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- Special Representative of the President for Nuclear Nonproliferation, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- U.S. Representative to the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- U.S. Representative to the United Nations Agencies for Food and Agriculture, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- U.S. Representative to the Organization for Security & Cooperation in Europe, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- Representative of the U.S. to the European Union, With the Rank and Status of Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary (x)
- Representative of the U.S. on the Council of the International Civil Aviation Organization (x)
- U.S. Representative to the Organization for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)

²¹ <https://history.state.gov/departmenthistory/people/principalofficers/chief-of-protocol>

- Representative of the U.S. to the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)
- Representative of the U.S. to the African Union, With the Rank and Status of Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary (x)
- Representative of the U.S. to the Association of the Southeast Asian Nations, With the Rank and Status of Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary (x)
- U.S. Representative to the Conference on Disarmament, With the Rank of Ambassador (x)

All of the positions with an X were also included in the 2016 dataset. The Burma position looks to have existed in 2016 but it was not included in the 2016 data. The formal position was created in 2008 in Public Law 110-286.²² It looks separate from any ambassador to Myanmar(Burma) The Plum Book includes an Ambassador to the Republic of North Macedonia but this was not in 2016.

The Plum Book includes an ambassadorial position but it was omitted from the 2016 list of ambassadors

This position was listed in Plum Book in 2016 but the name changed This position was listed in Plum Book in 2016 but the name changed Position listed in CRS report but cannot find any current evidence of its existence

Positions omitted from both the 2020 Plum Book and the CRS report

Position listed in CRS report but eliminated since 2017

The Plum Book includes an Ambassador to the Kingdom of Eswatini. This is the same as Swaziland, the name change coming in 2018 (<https://www.state.gov/countries-areas/eswatini/>)

The Plum Book lists an Ambassador to the Republic of North Macedonia. This is the new name of Macedonia after 2019 negotiations concluded.

The CRS Report includes an assistant administrator for policy, planning, and learning. This position is omitted from the plum book. It is also excluded from the Partnership for Public Service's list. I exclude it here.

The Partnership for Public Service also lists two new Associate Administrators: Relief, Response, and Resilience; Strategy and Operations. They omit policy, planning, and learning. They also split the Deputy Administrator into two, one for policy and programming and one for management and resources.²³ I add these positions. The last two received nominees early in the Biden Administration.²⁴

The CRS report includes a Senate confirmed Director of the International Broadcasting Bureau inside the U.S. Agency for Global Media (Broadcasting Board of Governors). This position was eliminated in 2016.²⁵

²² <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/PLAW-110publ286/html/PLAW-110publ286.htm>

²³ <https://ourpublicservice.org/political-appointee-tracker/>

²⁴ <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/06/03/president-biden-announces-key-nominations/>

²⁵ <https://uscode.house.gov/view.xhtml?path=/prelim@title22/chapter71&edition=prelim>

Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from the Plum Book	The CRS report lists an Executive Director and Alternate Executive Director for the IMF. This is excluded from the Plum Book.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from the Plum Book	The CRS report lists an Executive Director and Alternate Executive Director of the Inter-American Development Bank. These positions are omitted from the Plum Book.
Positions listed in CRS report but omitted from the Plum Book	The CRS report includes a U.S. Executive Director for the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development but this is excluded from the Plum Book.
Positions listed in CRS report but renamed in the Plum Book	The CRS report includes the Overseas Private Investment Corporation. This is now the U.S. International Development Finance Corporation
Positions listed in CRS report erroneously listed as being PAS	The CRS report included two positions in Peace Corps that do not require Senate confirmation, the Chief of Staff and the Deputy Chief of Staff. They were removed.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The CRS report includes a Peace Corps Advisory Council with 15 members. This was excluded from the Plum Book.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The CRS Report includes 9 members of the Advisory Board for Cuba Broadcasting. It is omitted from the Plum Book. It looks like good law.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omitted 2 of 7 members of the Board of Directors of the African Development Foundation
Positions listed in CRS report but these positions are regularly filled by other PAS appointees (i.e., dual-hatted)	The CRS report lists governors of the African Development Fund but these can be other Senate Confirmed persons and often are. These positions are omitted.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the U.S. Advisory Commission on Public Diplomacy
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the Assistant Secretary for Administration and Management in the Department of Labor but this position no longer requires Senate confirmation under P.L. 112-166. I cut it here.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Federal Mediation and Conciliation Service. I add it here. I use information from 2016 Plum book for details about pay, etc.
The Plum Book includes an extra commission position	The Plum Book includes 6 commissioners for the Federal Mine Safety and Health Review Commission and there are 5. I cut one.
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Chair of the National Endowment for the Arts. I add it here, using 2016 Plum Book for details about pay.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book incorrectly lists the National Mediation Board as having 5 members. Two were cut here.

Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The CRS report lists the National Science Board as requiring Senate confirmation but that is no longer true. It also lists them as being full time and they are not. The Plum Book omits them and has it right.
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Harry S Truman Scholarship Foundation Board of Trustees. I add it here.
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Legal Services Corporation. I add it here.
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the National Council on the Arts. I add it here.
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the National Council on the Humanities. I add it here.
Position listed in CRS report renamed	The former position of Under Secretary for National Protection and Programs is now the Director, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency
Position listed in CRS report replaced by elevated position	The Under Secretary for Strategy, Policy, and Plans in DHS replaces the Assistant Secretary for Policy in DHS.
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the Administrator, United States Fire Administration, as a PAS appointee. This position no longer requires Senate confirmation on PL 112-166
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the National Museum and Library Services Board but these members no longer require Senate confirmation under PL 112-166
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book excludes the Office of the Director of National Intelligence
Listed in Plum Book but is an error	The Plum Book includes the Administrator, E-Government and Information Technology, as a PAS appointee but they are not. It is cut from the list here.
Plum Book includes a duplicate	The Plum Book has the Office of Special Counsel included twice. I kept only one entry
Position listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Chair of the Special Panel on Appeals. I include it here.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Postal Service Board of Governors.
Three committees with jurisdiction	The CRS Report suggests that the Inspectors General for the National Reconnaissance Office and the National Security Agency go to Intelligence, Armed Services, and Homeland Security.
Plum Book includes a duplicate	The Plum Book includes the Inspector General for DOJ twice. I cut one.

Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Privacy and Civil Liberties Oversight Board.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the U.S. Sentencing Commission.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the State Justice Institute Board of Directors
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the Director of the Selective Service but this position no longer requires Senate confirmation after P.L. 112-166.
Position listed in Plum Book but omitted from the CRS report; created after 2017	The Plum Book includes an Assistant Secretary for Accountability and Whistleblower Protection. This was not in the CRS Report but it was created in 2017 which is why it was omitted.
Position listed in CRS report renamed	The CRS Report includes an Assistant Secretary for Policy and Planning. This was changed to Enterprise Integration.
Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book omits the Chief Financial Officer in the VA. The official serving in this role is also the Assistant Secretary for Management but this job no longer requires Senate confirmation but CFO does.
Position listed in Plum Book omitted from CRS report	The CRS report omits the Chairman of the Administrative Conference of the United States
Position listed in Plum Book omitted from CRS report	The CRS report omits the Chairman of the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation.
Listed in Plum Book but is an error; not PAS	The Plum Book includes the Arctic Research Commission but none of the commissioners require Senate confirmation.
Position listed in Plum Book omitted from CRS report; new position	The CRS Report omits the Chief Innovation and Intellectual Property Negotiator in the EOP but this position was created in February 2016 and likely omitted for that reason.
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes 3 members of the Council of Economic Advisers but only the chair still requires Senate confirmation after PL 112-166.
Plum Book error in organizational location	The Plum Book listed the Intellectual Property Enforcement Coordinator as an independent office, yet it is part of the EOP and OMB.
Position listed in Plum Book omitted from CRS report	The CRS Report omits the Marine Mammal Commission
Positions listed in Plum book but position no longer PAS	The Plum Book includes the Office of Navajo and Hopi Indian Relocation but this no longer requires Senate confirmation after PL 112-166.

Positions listed in CRS report omitted from Plum Book	The Plum Book data omits the positions in the Government Accountability Office
Error in details of incumbent	The Plum Book lists the chair of the DNFSB as continuing but he resigned in September, 2020, after the Plum Book had been published.
Removal of judges	The Plum Book lists the court of appeals for the armed forces, and military commission appellate judges. I do not include those here (and did not in 2016).
Plum Book error in details of positions	The Plum Book data includes the ODNI having fixed terms. The CRS report does not.
Position omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	The appointee tracker lists ambassador at large for anti-semitism but this is not in Plum Book or CRS report
Position omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	The appointee tracker lists coordinator for threat reduction programs but that is neither in the Plum Book nor CRS report
Plum Book includes a duplicate	The Plum Book lists the Ambassador to Bosnia and Herzegovina twice.
Plum Book omits and ambassador included in 2016 data	The Plum Book is missing the ambassador to Belize
Position omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	The Appointee tracker includes a CFO for Treasury but the Plum Book does not.
Position omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	The Appointee tracker includes an assistant secretary for financial stability but the Plum Book does not.
How many deputy administrators USAID	There is disagreement on the number of deputy administrators in USAID. There was one and then one more was added on June 3, 2021, after inauguration. I assume only one here. ²⁶
Dealing with holdovers	President Biden let US Marshals and US Attorneys stay until February but only two formal holdovers, Washington DC and Delaware. I count these positions as vacant. ²⁷ This was a tough call. It could go either way in calculating vacant positions and time to nomination.
Dealing with holdovers	US Attorneys holdover data comes from DOJ website on January 21, 2021. ²⁸
Dealing with holdovers	For US marshals, I start with list from Plum book and consider all vacant positions vacant. I double check each US marshal to determine whether they hold over using US Marshals service current bios. There were none confirmed late in 2020 so the Plum Book should be current other than those that retired.

²⁶ <https://www.usaid.gov/news-information/press-releases/june-3-2021-administrator-power-statement-usaid-structure>

²⁷ <https://www.wsj.com/articles/biden-administration-to-ask-dozens-of-trump-appointed-u-s-attorneys-to-resign-11612846069>

²⁸ <https://web.archive.org/web/20210125005242/https://www.justice.gov/usao/us-attorneys-listing>

Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	Congress created the Civil Rights Cold Case Review Board (5 members). This new (and temporary) agency was created in 2019 and first nominees were put forward in 2021. It is not listed in the 2020 Plum Book or the 2017 CRS report.
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	There is a federal cochair for an the Southeast Crescent Regional Commission that is omitted from both that received a nomination in 2021.
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	There was a new Assistant Secretary of Defense for Space Policy that received a nominee in 2021. This position was not included in either the Plum Book or the CRS Report.
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	Both the Plum Book and the CRS report omit one of two deputy administrators in USAID
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	Both the Plum Book and the CRS report omit a new Assistant Secretary of the Air Force for Space Acquisition and Integration (https://www.defensenews.com/congress/2019/12/10/congress-creating-space-force-with-limited-head-room/)
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	Both the Plum Book and the CRS report omit a special envoy to Monitor and Combat Anti-semitism
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	In the Senate nominations data, there is a nomination for Bidtah N. Becker to a new position on the National Council of the Arts for a term expiring September 3, 2022 and it is identified as a new position.
Positions omitted from both Plum Book and CRS report	Neither the CRS Report nor the Plum Book included the Northern Great Plains Regional Authority or the Denali Commission
Positions included in CRS report but no longer requires presidential appointment	The 2017 CRS Report includes the Board of Regents of the Uniformed Services University. Current law indicates that the Board of Regents is selected by the Secretary of Defense, not the president. ²⁹

References

Congressional Research Service. 2021. *Federal Regional Commissions and Authorities: Structural Features and Function*. CRS Report R45997, December 22, 2021 (<https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/R/R45997>, accessed February 4, 2022).

Davis, Christopher M., and Michael Greene. 2017. *Presidential Appointee Positions Requiring Senate Confirmation and Committees Handling Nominations*. CRS Report RL30959, May 3, 2017 (<https://fas.org/sgp/crs/misc/RL30959.pdf>, accessed December 16, 2019).

²⁹ See:

<https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/IF/IF11385/2#:~:text=In%201972%2C%20Congress%20established%20two,Services%20University%20of%20the%20Health>. See also: 10 USC 2113a: Board of Regents. There are, however, nominations all the way up through 2005-6.

Richardson, Mark D., Joshua D. Clinton, and David E. Lewis. 2018. "Elite Perceptions of Agency Ideology and Workforce Skill." *Journal of Politics* 80(1):303-7.

Selin, Jennifer L., and David E. Lewis. 2018. *Sourcebook of United States Executive Agencies*, rev. ed. Report for the Administrative Conference of the United States (<https://www.acus.gov/publication/sourcebook-united-states-executive-agencies-second-edition>, accessed December 16, 2019).